

Asbury Theological Seminary ePLACE: preserving, learning, and creative exchange

Syllabi

eCommons

1-1-2005

CH 710 Pietism in the Christian Tradition

J. Steven O'Malley

Follow this and additional works at: <http://place.asburyseminary.edu/syllabi>

Recommended Citation

O'Malley, J. Steven, "CH 710 Pietism in the Christian Tradition" (2005). *Syllabi*. Book 1376.
<http://place.asburyseminary.edu/syllabi/1376>

This Document is brought to you for free and open access by the eCommons at ePLACE: preserving, learning, and creative exchange. It has been accepted for inclusion in Syllabi by an authorized administrator of ePLACE: preserving, learning, and creative exchange. For more information, please contact thad.horner@asburyseminary.edu.

CH 710XL

Pietism in the Christian Tradition

J. Steven O'Malley, Instructor

Asbury Theological Seminary

Fall Semester, 2005

Email address: steven_o'malley@asburyseminary.edu

Office Phone: (859)858-2260

Online Office Hours: Monday and Friday, 12-2 pm

Welcome

I am delighted to be joining with you in this new learning venture. It is our privilege here to join together in exploring and sharing in the odyssey of a remarkable company of women and men, whose common heritage is in bearing witness to the living Christ as the ground for personal salvation and social and historical transformation. It is to acknowledge that we are not alone in ministry; rather, it is to discover vital resources from the past that can empower and guide us who seek to become partakes in that vital company of the committed. In the annals of church history, the Pietist movement stands out as a peak period of light and renewal. It was a truly grassroots phenomenon that became global in its outreach, and was instrumental in the rise of numerous evangelical movements and church bodies, including Methodism. This "company" was filled with its share of shortcomings as well as achievements of faith, and our awareness of both can hopefully enhance our capacity to live out our ministries unto Christ and his people with greater discernment and faithfulness to the Lord of the Church.

I appreciate your willingness to invite me into your home to explore these issues with you, and look forward to learning something about you as well. Before we begin our journey together, please send me an email (50 words in length is preferred) indicating either (a)

what kind of experiences help you learn best, or (b) how you think this study may help you in your becoming equipped for ministry.

Note: our learning will occur around one-week modules, with a week beginning at 9 am Monday (EST). Please send me your first email within this time frame.

Class Structure

The Course Center will contain a copy of the syllabus as well as all class modules.

The Discussion Center will be used for all public communications. Anytime you have a question or comment about the course, the modules, the assignments, you should post to the course center.

The CH710XL Office is for private correspondence between you and me (you may address me Dr. O'Malley, Dr. O., or Dr. Steve). This will contain any items you do not want to appear publicly before all your classmates.

The Archives Center will be used for storing conversations that have already taken place during the course of the semester. This keeps the discussion center from becoming too unmanageable.

The Chat Center is intended for real-time interaction among students. you can get together with other members to study, ask questions, or to explore topics. None of these conversations are ever saved.

The Resource Center provides access to a number of specific tools available to all Exl students. These include access to the B.L. Fisher Library, the Services in Estes Chapel, Exl updates, Guidelines for Success, Helpful Hints, Interesting Links, a Powerpoint Viewer as well as a Real Audio player.

Support

The following individuals can provide help to you should the need arise:

Jared Porter (Exl_Support@asburyseminary.edu) can provide technical support should you encounter any difficulties.

Amy Jo Adams, the Exl Coach (Exl_Coach@asburyseminary.edu) or Kevin Osborn, the Exl Director (Exl_Director@asburyseminary.edu) can handle any number of questions you might have regarding the Exl program.

Hannah Kirsch (Hannah_Kirsch@asburyseminary.edu) is the Exl reference librarian. Dorothy James (Dorothy_James@asburyseminary.edu) is the Exl contact for interlibrary loans.

Class Description and Objectives:

Description: An exploration of the variety of theological texts and traditions represented by Continental Pietism in their historical setting and in relation to American Christianity. Prerequisite: either CH501 or CH502, or CH500 for students in MA programs not requiring CH501-2.

This course will have these objectives. First, the major objective will be a preliminary examination of the principal figures in Continental (German and Dutch) Pietism of the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, with attention given to their writings within the historical and theological contexts. A second objective is to examine the implications of these Pietist sources as a primary expression of Christian renewal in modern Christianity, and to enhance our grounding in the doctrine and praxis of Christian ministry for the present day. Third, we will identify American movements and denominations that represent an interaction between Continental Pietist sources and the American historical milieu. Fourth, it is intended that this study will serve to raise the awareness level of the need for ongoing research and writing in the history and theology of Pietism, particularly in the North American context. Although considerable research in Pietism continues to be done in Europe, largely in the German language, American scholars have only focused critical attention on this field within the last generation. This imbalance needs to be corrected, in view of the deep and pervasive influence Pietism has had in American religious and literary life. Fifth, our intention is to help open a conversation between the ongoing and extensive research in German Pietism and Anglo-American Wesleyan studies.

Textbooks for Purchase:

Course Packet: miscellaneous articles on Pietist sources

Peter Erb, ed., The Pietists; Classics of Christian Spirituality Series (Paulist Press)

G. Tersteegen, I: Life and Letters, II: Sermons and Hymns (Harvey and Tait, n.d.)
[two paperbacks]

T. Tappert, ed. and tr., P.J. Spener: Pia Desideria (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1964)

Collateral (Optional):

J. Steven O'Malley, Early German-American Evangelicalism (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow/University Press of America, 1995).

F. Ernest Stoeffler, Continental Pietism and American Christianity (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1976). (reprint ed.) (=Stoeffler IV in reading list)

F. Ernest Stoeffler, The Rise of Evangelical Pietism, (Leiden: Brill, 1966) and
German Pietism in the Eighteenth Century (Leiden: Brill, 1973); (=Stoeffler I and II in reading list)

Consult the following website for online research:

ATS website; library homepage: go to restricted databases, then to the blue RPA icon, then select ATLA database (on left column); search by subject, author, or title; or go to "advanced search" (book reviews, etc.). See information commons for further assistance: x2233.

Accessing Information Commons Materials:

1. General Questions:

□ The Information Commons is a "one-stop shop" for all student research, circulation and technical needs. The Information Commons hours are posted here:
<http://www.asburyseminary.edu/icommons/hours.shtml>.

2. Materials Requests:

□ To search the library catalog for available materials, click here:
<http://www.asburyseminary.edu/icommons/index.shtml>

□ ExL Students may request books, photocopies or emailed attachments of journal articles/reference books from Asbury Seminary's Library. Please allow 3-10 business days for all requests to be filled. Contact the Information Commons for costs and instructions on how to make requests.

□ ExL students are encouraged to make use of local library resources. Students who live within a 50 mile radius of either the Florida or the Kentucky campus should come to campus to obtain their materials.

3. Research Questions:

□ ExL students are encouraged to contact the Information Commons for research assistance including help choosing a paper topic, determining the best sources to use for a paper, finding book reviews, or research questions about using the online databases or any other library materials.

4. Online Databases:

□ To access the online library resources including the library catalog and full-text journal databases, go to <http://www.asburyseminary.edu/icommons/index.shtml> and enter your 10-digit student ID# number in the login box. Your student ID# is provided on the biographical information section of the student registration webpage. Add a 2 and enough 0's to the front to make a 10-digit number (20000XXXXX where XXXXX = your student id).

Class Procedures:

1. There will be text lectures on the rise and development of Continental Pietism in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, as well as the formation of principal German-American religious traditions in the eighteenth and early nineteenth-centuries.

These will be sent to the class as part of the weekly course modules. They will serve as background for the reading in Pietist literature which each student will do (1500 pages is the ATS standard for reading in a 3-hour course). Plan to keep a log of your reading, including both class reading assignments and personal reading chosen from the broader literature on the movement. Consult the ATLA data base and websites on Pietism, and include literature from these sources in reading (bibliography to be submitted on last day of class.)

(20 %)

2. Plan to coordinate with other class members in responding to weekly discussion questions on the literature of the Pietist movement. Further guidelines for this are given below this section. These questions will guide our discussion together in the course center for each module. They will focus on interpreting and applying the insights from the readings, and understanding the historical and theological contexts behind them. Responses can range in length, depending on what is being discussed. See "discussion guidelines" given below, and see weekly modules (30 % of grade)

3. Write a research paper (15-20 pages, doubled-spaced and documented), on a particular area of interest in the Pietist movement. The topic to be addressed needs to be chosen by mid-term, and is to be done in conversation with myself. It will be due at the beginning of the last week of class. Guidelines to assist you in writing the paper will be provided, and these will also be guidelines used in my response to your paper. My intention is to assist you in gaining a deeper understanding of a particular aspect of the Pietist movement, that has implications for the living of our lives and our ministries today. [note: Research literature beyond the course texts can be found in the ATLA data base, under the library section of the ATLA website. The Information Commons can send you either scanned or hard copies of literature requested from this source. Please give one week lead time for processing and sending your requests. Call (858 3581) or email with your requests.] (25%) Present to the class a synopsis (ca. 400-500 words) of your research during the last three weeks of the course. Paper is due December 12. (5%)

4. Our study will conclude with an each class member responding to an integrative question, designed to pull together your learning in the course, and to assess its significance for ministry. Your essay is due December 16. Here is the question:

It has been held that Pietism was instrumental in the development of Christianity as an influential religion in the modern world. Evaluate this claim with reference to one of the following four areas of concern (select one): (a) Protestant theology, (b) missions, (c) church renewal and ecumenism, or (d) social and political reform.

Your essay should reflect organization, correct grammar, and use of 3 primary and three secondary sources. Conclusions need to be supported by the writings of at least one Pietist figure, who contributed to this area of concern. (20 %)

(percentages given are based on following scale: #1. 20%=40

#2. 30%=60

#3. 30%=60

#4. 20%=40

100%=200

grading follows ATS catalog: 90-100%=A, 80-89%=B, etc.)

Discussion Guidelines

Questions to ask the texts to be read through the course:

For every text:

1. What is most surprising to you about this text? (or)
what would be your church's response to this text?
2. How are you drawn to God/Christ by this text? (or)
how does it challenge your personal theology/Christian praxis?

Questions for specific texts:

3. What is the operating view of sin and grace at work here?
4. What is the underlying view of anthropology (the doctrine of humanity) present here?
5. What is the picture of Jesus Christ that is implicit in this text?
6. What is the prevailing understanding in this text of how these resources are to be interpreted and understood: Scripture, tradition, reason, experience?
7. What implications does this text have for visualizing how the "community of the redeemed" is to be identified and structured?
Corollary: what clues are there on how to relate to the existing institutional churches of that day?
8. What hints or directives does this text provide as to how we are to make use of the means of grace, including the sacraments?
9. What are the implications here for Christian personal/social ethics?
10. What is the overarching view of the direction of history, and the role of believers in effecting its outcome?

[Instructions for responding to the questions in our weekly online discussion: By 9 PM on Wednesday, indicate in the course center which question (from #3-10) you plan to answer; if more than one person is interested in the same question, confer with one another to opt for a plan "B" or a suitable division of labor. Then, after reading the texts for the week, post a response in the course center to questions one or two—which gives you an opportunity to say something about the personal impact on you, then post a response to the question you have selected from #3 to 10 (suggested total length of responses: 100-300 words). The response needs to be posted by Saturday, 9 pm. By midnight on Sunday, post a response to one of your classmates, indicating how their answer provided particular insight and/or what questions it raised for you.

In some modules, you are also asked to compare the insights of one writer with another, sometimes in a pro/contra/reply format; here you will need to operate as a team: do some "brainstorming" together (in the course center), decide together what comparative observations you want to make, and designate one person to post them (ca 100-200 words) by Sunday midnight. It is recommended that you rotate the responsibility for doing this posting on behalf of the team. (5 points max. per individual responses and 3 points max. for team responses. I will be responding to each of your posts, after Sunday of each week.

Also, if you have additional questions or insights, that do not “fit” into the question you are answering, you are welcome to make that into a voluntary post, in the course center, at any time. As a guideline, when you make voluntary posts, try to focus on historical, theological aspects, or aspects concerning personal application of insights learned from the text. I hope these guidelines help our focus in our weekly study; let me know of any questions or suggestions! Godspeed as you proceed!]

The instructor will respond to messages sent in response to coursework in a timely fashion, as well as questions sent to the office.

key: Stoeffler I= F.E. Stoeffler, The Rise of Evangelical Pietism (Brill, 1966)

Stoeffler II=F.E. Stoeffler, German Pietism in the Eighteenth Century (Brill, 1973)

Class Schedule:

Module One

(9/6-11)

Who are the Pietists? A historical introduction

- Brown, 11-28, 90-107, Stoeffler, I, 1-23; Erb, The Pietists, Introduction
- text lecture on historical background
- an overview of our course; selecting the sources to read
- Strom: “Problems and Promises of Pietism Research,” in Church History, (2002), 536-553.

Module Two

9/12-18)

John Arndt: Precursor of Pietism

- Readings in Arndt, True Christianity 1-17, 21-25, 29-51
- Stoeffler, I, 202-212
- Questions (1-10 applicable; include last week’s readings from Arndt; note cprsns of Luther, orthodox, and Arndt on the way to Christ)

Module Three

(9/19-25)

Philip Jacob Spener: Father of Lutheran Pietism

- Readings in Pia Desideria, 1, 1-86
- Textlecture; Kohl, “Wiedergeburt as the Central Theme in Pietism,” (1973) –read Spener section.
- Questions (1-10 applicable; did the program meet the problem? how much is transferable_and how much is only right for that culture?)

Module Four (9/26-10/2)

Spener the Pastor-Theologian

- Pia Desideria, 87-122
- Erb, The Pietists, 50-96
- Questions (update responses from last week, with data from the readings for this week; also, what are the factors Spener is balancing as he describes the way to Christ; the future of history?)

Module Five (10/3-10/9))

A.H. Francke and the Blossoming of Pietist Reforms

- Erb, The Pietists, 99-166
- Textlecture; Kohl: read Francke segment; Zehrer, “The Relationship between Pietism in Halle and Early Methodism,” Methodist History (1979), 210-224.
- Questions: (1-10 applicable; comparisons of Spener and F. on the way to Christ; the program of social reform: patronizing or prophetic?)

Module Six (10/10-10/16))

The Moravians: The Unity of the Brethren

- Count Zinzendorf: Erb, 291-330,
- Textlecture; Kohl: read Zinzendorf section.
- Questions (1-10 applicable; see team exercise below)
- Pro/contra/reply group discussion:

Halle/Herrnhut/John Wesley
on the “ordo salutis”

[see guidelines for this discussion, in appendix to syllabus]

related readings: Wesley/Zinzendorf controversy, in Outler, John Wesley, 353-376;

W.R. Ward, The Great Evangelical Awakening, 302-315.

Modules Seven-Eight

(10/17-10/30)

Reformed Pietists: consisting of Labadie, Precisianist, and Federalists

- background: text lecture on the Heidelberg Catechism, noting its main doctrinal emphases; read selection of the Catechism, “Our Only Comfort,” 17-21, 88-100.
- Jean de Labadie: proto pietist
Stoeffler, I, 162-169; see database (see also discussion of Labadie in website: “Philip Jacob Spener’s Protestant Doctrine of the Church”)
[collateral reading: T.J. Saxby, The Quest for the New Jerusalem: Jean de Labadie and the Labadists, 1610-1744 (Martinus Nijhof, 1987).]
- Dutch Precisianism: Ames
Stoeffler, I, 109-117(background), and Eusden, “Marrow,” 3-20.
- The Federal (Covenant) Theologians: Cocceius, Lampe, Otterbein
Stoeffler I, 169-176 (from Holland to Germany); O’Malley, Early German-American Evangelicalism, 246-269 (Lampe and associates); Core, “Otterbein: The Salvation-Bringing Incarnation,” 77-90.
[collateral reading on Cocceius: Willem J. van Asselt, The Federal Theology of Johannes Cocceius (1603-69) (Brill, 2001), pp. 1-33, 303-321]

Questions (1-10 applicable; how do these writers “soften” or modify Calvin and “traditional” Calvinism? what is the “new” method of learning that underlay these writers, and how does it challenge traditional pedagogy (esp. Ames)? Was Labadie friend or foe of church renewal? assess; What is the correlation between personal and universal salvation history (esp. Lampe)?

Module Nine

(10/31-11/6)

Radical Pietism: Arnold, von Hochenau, the Berleburg Bible

- Textlecture on Radical Pietism and Gottfried Arnold; Arnold: Erb, 99-107
- von Hochenau: Renkewitz, 1-56, 111-138, 147-8
- the Berleburg Bible and the Philadelphians: Stoeffler, II, 208-216; O’Malley, Early German-American Evangelicism, 271-299
- Questions (1-10; what are the marks of a radical Pietist? are they productive or counter-productive for church renewal? at what points do they challenge “church” Pietists? Is there a place for radical Pietists

in our day?)

Module Ten-Eleven

(11/7-11/20)

Gerhard Tersteegen: the first modern pastoral theologian

- a composite of church and radical Pietism
- Pietist hymnody
- textlecture; Tersteegen, *Life and Letters*, 5-58, 61-71, 84-106; *Sermons and Hymns*, 1-23, 39-65, 98-144; O'Malley, "Wesley and Tersteegen...", in Wesleyan Theological Journal, (1996), 48-70.

Questions (1-10; how does Tersteegen "contextualize" the Pietist message in the lay, non-technical language of practical piety? How many analogues can we find between evangelical Christian doctrine (especially that of the Heidelberg Catechism—in his essays, poems, and letters? how do they speak to the "postmodern" condition of Christianity? How do they resonate with the Wesleyan tradition?)

[11/21-11/25: Fall Reading Week: Complete course paper.]

Module Twelve

(11/28-12/4)

Württemberg Pietism

- A. Bengel as Bible expositor and ethicist at Tübingen (John Wesley's mentor in biblical exposition!)
- F.C. Oetinger: bearer of a Neo-Pietist worldview
- the Blumhardts: healing and social reform
- Stoeffler, II, 88-120, Erb, 255-274, Macchia, 21-94

Module Thirteen

(12/5-12/11)

Pietist Traditions in America

- Radical Pietist communities in Pennsylvania; focus: the Ephrata Cloister
- Pietist denominations: focus: The Pietist movement in American Lutheranism, The Moravian Church (including the Congregation of God in the Spirit), The German Reformed Church, The Church of the Brethren, The Brethren in Christ,

- The Church of the United Brethren in Christ, The Evangelical Association, The Evangelical United Brethren Church, The Evangelical Covenant Church
- Textlecture
- Core, Otterbein, 120-127; selections from the journals of Christian Newcomer (United Brethren bishop), 81-94, and John Seybert (Evangelical bishop), 185-210.
- Questions (what is the long-term contribution of the Pietist denominations to American Christianity? –identify specific areas....)

Module Fourteen (12/12-12/16)

Open discussion: sharing of insights and issues raised from research papers; where we go from here....

Paper due (#3 in syllabus) on December 12.

Write integrative essay (#4 in syllabus), due December 16.

For Further Reading (including some German titles for those with facility in that language):

websites:

Pietism Studies Group, see archives of papers:

Moravian Theological Seminary

Evangelical United Brethren: see United Theological Seminary

Young Center for Pietist and Anabaptist Studies

Martin Luther Universität Halle: see Interdisciplinary Center for Pietist Studies

Asbury Theological Seminary: see ATLA database for figures and movements in Pietism

Bach, Jeffrey Alan, Voices of the Turtledoves: The Mystical Language of the Ephrata Cloister (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University, 1997), 485 pp.

Benz, Ernst, “Ecumenical Relations between Boston Puritanism and German Pietism: Mather and Francke,” Harvard Theological Review 45 (1961), 159-193.

Brown, Dale W., Understanding Pietism (Revised Edition) (Evangel Press, 1996).

Doctrines and Discipline of the Evangelical Association (1817 or earliest available edition)

Erb, Peter, John Arndt; The True Christianity; Classics of Western Spirituality (Paulist)

Eusden, John, William Ames: Marrow of Divinity (Introduction)

Gawthrop, Richard, "For the Good of Thy Neighbor; Pietism and the Making of Eighteenth-century Prussia," (Ph.D. dissertation, Indiana University, 1984)

Heidelberg Catechism (Philadelphia: United Church Press, 1963).

Kisker, Scott, "Radical Pietism and Early German Methodism: John Seybert and the Evangelical Association," Methodist History (April, 1999), 175-188.

Kohl, Manfred, "*Wiedergeburt* as the Central Theme in Pietism," The Covenant Quarterly (November, 1974), 15-35.

Longenecker, Stephen, Piety and Tolerance: Pennsylvania-German Religion (Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1994)

Miller, George, Practical Christianity (Cleveland, n.d.)
(original: Kurze und deutliche Lehren zum Wahren und Thätigen Christenthum. Reading, 1814)

Möller, Grete, "Föederalismus und Geschichtsbetrachtung in XVII & XVIII. Jahrhundert," in Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte L. (1931), 292-440.

Mulhenberg, Henry Melchior, Correspondence. Vol. 1, (1740-47). Ed. and tr. by H.W. Kleinert and H.T. Lehmann. (Camden, Me: Picton, 1993); Vol. 3 (1763-68), ed. by Kurt Aland (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1990); Vol. 4 (1769-1776), ed. by K. Aland (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1993).

Müller, Thomas J., Die Kirche zwischen zwei Welten: Die Obrigkeitsproblematik bei Heinrich Melchior Muhlenberg und die kirchengründung der deutschen Lutheraner in Amerika. (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1994) Transatlantische historische Studium, 2. 302pp.

Nelson, James D., "Jacob Albright: Founder, Reformer, or Radical Pietist" (unpublished article)

Newcomer, Christian, Journal, Abram Sangrey, ed. (1996 ed.)

O'Malley, J. Steven, "A Distinctive German-American Credo: The United Brethren Confession of Faith," Asbury Theological Journal (spring, 1987), 51-64.

_____, "On the Journey Home; History of Missions of the Evangelical United Brethren Church," (unpublished mss.)

_____, Pilgrimage of Faith; The Legacy of the Otterbeins (Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, 1973).

_____, "The EUB Confession of Faith in Comparison with The Methodist Articles of Religion," in Russell E. Richey, William B. Lawrence, and Dennis M. Campbell, United Methodism and American Culture: Doctrines and Disciplines (Abingdon, 1999).

_____, Touched by Godliness; Bishop John Seybert and the Evangelical Heritage (Topeka, KS: Granite, 1986).

Sattler, Gary, God's Glory; Neighbor's Good: A Brief Introduction to the Life and Writings of August Hermann Francke (1982)

Schaff, Philip, The Creeds of Christendom, I and III (on the Heidelberg Catechism)

Schmidt, Martin, "Epochen der Pietismusforschung," in Der Pietismus als Theologische Erscheinung; Gesammelte Studien zur Geschichte des Pietismus, Band II (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 1984), 34-83.

Schrenk, Gottlob, Gottesreich und Bund im älteren Protestantismus (Gütersloh: C. Bertelsmann, 1923).

Seybert, John, Journal (microfilm, 1821-1855)

Stein, K. James, Philipp Jakob Spener; Pietist Patriarch (Chicago: Covenant Press, 1986)

Stoeffler, F. Ernest, German Pietism During the Eighteenth Century (Leiden: Brill, 1973)
(=Stoeffler II on reading list)

Stoeffler, F. Ernest, Mysticism in the Devotional Literature of Colonial Pennsylvania (Lancaster, Pa: Pennsylvania-German Folklore Society, 1949) (=Stoeffler III)

Stoeffler, F. Ernest, The Rise of Evangelical Pietism (Leiden: Brill, 1966)
(=Stoeffler I on reading list)

Vogt, Peter, An Authentic Relation (Zinzendorf's American correspondence, 1742) (New York: George Ohms, 1998)

Ward, W.Reginald, The Protestant Evangelical Awakening
(Cambridge,1993)

additional titles on Pietist themes to be found in: Pietist and Wesleyan Studies Series, edited by D. Bundy and J.S. O'Malley, and published by Scarecrow/University Press of America

Guidelines for evaluating historical texts from Pietist writers, when used in research papers:

- a. Consider what are the historical and theological significance of the document within the larger contexts of the Pietist tradition and that of American church history.
- b. Give a brief review of literature that pertains to the document (primary and secondary).
- c. Evaluate the historiography represented in # b above.
- d. Examine the document using the theological and historical insights that pertain to the text under consideration.
- e. Conclusions: In light of the findings in # d above, indicate how the existing historiography is vindicated or stands in need of revision.